Leadership Traits of High Effective United Methodist Pastors

Dissertation Summary of Bishop Grant Hagiya for the Doctor of Education degree in Organizational Leadership at Pepperdine University
Dissertation Problem

Observation

- Some United Methodist clergy seem to be able to grow a local church no matter what the conditions of the church, demographics, or previous leadership of the church.

Why?
Research Question

“What traits, qualities, or characteristics, if any, do highly effective and successful United Methodist Church ministers exhibit specifically in regard to growth of their churches when compared to less effective United Methodist Church ministers?”
Quantitative Results

On the BarOn Assessment of Emotional Intelligence there was a significant correlation at the .05 level in total EQ score between high effective and low effective United Methodist clergy.

There was a significant correlation on 15 of the 20 sub-scales of the BarOn also.
Quantitative Results

There was a correlation at the .05 level in terms of the church size & vitality of high effective vs low effective United Methodist clergy.

There was a correlation at the .05 level in regard to the self ranking of high and low United Methodist clergy on ministry leadership & effectiveness.
Qualitative Results

1. High Effective United Methodist Clergy excel in Emotional Intelligence

Key Results from the In-Depth Interviews
Emotional intelligence is made up of four core skills.
Emotional Intelligence
Goleman, Buyatziz, Mckee (2002)

Personal Competence: These capabilities determine how we manage ourselves.

Self-Awareness:

- Emotional self-awareness
- Accurate self-assessment
- Self-confidence
Emotional Intelligence

Self-Management:

• Emotional self-control
• Transparency
• Adaptability
• Achievement
• Optimism

What I See

What I Do

Personal Competence

Self Awareness

Self Management

Social Competence

Social Awareness

Relationship Management
**Emotional Intelligence**

**Social Competence:** These capabilities determine how we manage relationships.

**Social Awareness:**

- Empathy
- Organizational awareness
- Service
Emotional Intelligence

Relationship Management:

• Inspirational leadership
• Influence
• Developing others
• Change catalyst
• Conflict management
• Building bonds
• Teamwork & collaboration
Johari Window

- **Known to Others**
  - **Blind Self**
    - Unknown to us
    - Known to others
  - **Open Self**
    - Known to us
    - Known to others
- **Unknown to Self**
  - **Unknown Self**
    - Unknown to us
    - Unknown to others
  - **Concealed Self**
    - Unknown to us
    - Unknown to others
- **Unknown to Others**
2. High Effective United Methodist Clergy excel in **Transformational Leadership**

- This is demonstrated in their commitment to “empowerment of the laity”

- **Paradigm:** They see the gifts in others, name & cultivate those gifts, and unleash these gifts and people into the ministry & community
Key Results from the In-Depth Interviews

3. High Effective United Methodist Clergy possess a deep well of faith in a Triune God, from which spring their values, behaviors, attitudes and decisions.

- This faith effects directly other key themes: vision, humility, resilience, and passion in ministry.
12 Key Results from the In-Depth Interviews

4. High Effective United Methodist Clergy have a passion for their work in ministry, and are engaged and focused in their work.

5. High Effective United Methodist Clergy possess a deep humility that stems from their allegiance to a higher authority & calling.
Key Results from the In-Depth Interviews

6. High Effective United Methodist Clergy **all have** mentors who have shaped their formation, leadership in ministry and provided trust and counsel.

- None of the High Effective United Methodist Clergy had official “Coaches” in their ministry.
Key Results from the In-Depth Interviews

7. High Effective UMC Clergy overall demonstrate entrepreneurial traits and behaviors.

• Some have problems with the word “entrepreneurial,”

• Strictly defined as: “Immediately seizing on opportunities & avoiding hazards.”
Key Results from the In-Depth Interviews

8. High Effective United Methodist Clergy **excel in oral & written communications**. They are some of the top preachers of their annual conferences.

9. High Effective United Methodist Clergy **demonstrate resiliency** in their personal & professional set-backs, and attribute such resiliency to their faith life and practice.
As a corollary to the question on mentors and resiliency, there does exist a glass ceiling for women clergy, and through both personal experience with sexism and statistics, sexism provides a significant hurdle for women in ministry.
10. High Effective United Methodist Clergy have a **personal vision**, and that vision does have an impact on the larger vision of the church where they serve.

11. High Effective United Methodist Clergy **understand systems theory** and organizational development.
Key Results from the In-Depth Interviews

As a corollary to this finding there exists an emphasis on the **dynamic relationship** between faith and leadership development.

- All of the high effective United Methodist clergy combined both of these elements.
- However, that which has led to their success at the local church would be the combination of both.
Regular Practice

Internal Self

Leadership knowledge

Spirituality
Faith development alone can produce more deeply spiritual and pious individuals, but may lack the leadership skills to take the church to the next level.

Leadership development alone can produce more efficient leaders, but may lack the faith development for the right reasons for leadership and the passion for sustained ministry.
12 Key Results from the In-Depth Interviews

Both seem necessary for a truly effective church leader and system of the church.

Faith & Spiritual Development + Leadership Development Skills = Highly Successful Church Leaders & Churches
Finally, the local church’s situation and context does matter.

- Demographics, history, past leadership, location all make a difference.
- However, the quality of the clergy leadership to adapt to the context makes a huge difference in the ultimate success of the church.
LIMITATION WITH COMPETENCIES

Rule of thumb: 10,000 hours to reach beginning stages of mastery (10 yrs of daily practice).

Problem: It is limited to the parameters of a single disciple or context (e.g. chess master).

The complexity of the mastery of ministry.
LIMITATION WITH COMPETENCIES

DeShon and Quinn: “multitasking and polychronic orientation”
“I have never encountered such a fast-paced job with such varied and impactful responsibilities.”
How many of us have put in 10,000 hrs. exclusively on preaching, counseling, teaching, etc.
LIMITATION WITH COMPETENCIES

It is not the individual mastery of roles of ministry, but the integration of such roles that produces a seamless leadership that makes wise decisions. However, high effective clergy combine one additional element in their individualistic mastery: Originality and Innovation.
LIMITATION WITH COMPETENCIES

The high effective clergy who continue to grow and vitalize their churches combine mastery and originality as the foundation of their success. One without the other will not do. They are master practitioners who also continue to search for new and novel ways to carry out their ministry.
BALANCE

- Fostering the balance between:
  - Mastery----------------------------Originality
Roger Martin

• “The great ones utilize their experiences to build and deepen their mastery while maintaining and expressing their originality. Average leaders do one or the other. Some deepen their mastery over time but never learn to trust their ability to express originality. They keep the proverbial trains running but will never invent the future.”
“Watch out,” warns Amy Edmondson of the Harvard Business School, “because our natural tendencies, the way we are hardwired, will lead us to favor mastery over originality, will lead us to keep going in the direction we are going and try to improve marginally around the edges on what we’re already doing. In so doing, we utterly miss opportunities to make a big difference, something brand new and exciting.”
INNOVATION DIAGRAM

Goal too big: “End World Hunger”

Sweet Spot

Goal too Small: “File today’s paperwork”
BOOTLEGGING TIME

3M Pioneered this concept: 20% of the working time of researchers can be spent on any topic of passion or interest. However, this is structured: accountability. How can we structure this into our ministry schedule?
One Key Takeaway from Positive Deviance Research

“It’s easier to act your way into a new way of thinking, than to think your way into a new way of acting.”

“A focus on practice rather than knowledge has proven to be the key element in bringing about lasting behavior change...”
PERFORMANCE COACHING

• Coupling this focus on behaviors with a performance coach who holds the person accountable is proving to be more successful in achieving results than old paradigms of learning.
QUESTIONS

• What one or two things can we do to really increase our clergy effectiveness?

• How can we align the whole system behind such objectives?

• Who are the key champions we need to enlist toward this end?
Quantitative Results

On the LPI Assessment of Transformational Leadership the results were mixed and inconclusive. There was a correlation at the .05 level on 2 of the 5 LPI scales between high effective and low effective United Methodist clergy.
THE LIFE CYCLE OF AN ORGANIZATION

Start up
Entrepreneurial Practices

High Growth

Decline
Managerial Practices

Survival
Another original innovation spun off

New original innovation spun off of it

Original Life Cycle of the Organization
Research Design

Quantitative Analysis:

Comparison of High Effective United Methodist Clergy with Lower Effective Clergy on Emotional Intelligence and Transformational Leadership Assessments

- EQ = BarOn Assessment
- TL = Leadership Practices Inventory (LPI)
Research Design

Quantitative Analysis:

Comparison of High Effective United Methodist Clergy with Lower Effective Clergy on:

- Their present church appointment in terms of church size and vitality.
- Their self ranking in terms of perception of their personal leadership and ministry effectiveness.
Research Design

Qualitative Analysis:
In-depth Interviews with 10 High Effective United Methodist Clergy to isolate key traits, characteristics, and qualities of their effectiveness.